
MEETING	PLANNING COMMITTEE
DATE	16 FEBRUARY 2012
PRESENT	COUNCILLORS CUNNINGHAM-CROSS (CHAIR), GALVIN (VICE-CHAIR), AYRE, BOYCE, D'AGORNE, DOUGHTY, FUNNELL, KING, MCILVEEN, MERRETT, REID, SIMPSON-LAING, WATSON, WATT, WILLIAMS AND HYMAN (SUB FOR CLLR FIRTH)
APOLOGIES	COUNCILLOR FIRTH

35. INSPECTION OF SITES

Site	Reason for Visit	Members Attended
Abattoir, Murton Lane, Murton (11/03259/FULM)	To enable Members to view the site.	Cllrs Boyce, Cunningham-Cross, D'Agorne, Funnell, Galvin, McIlveen, Merrett, Reid, Watson and Watt.
Plot 8b, Great North Way, Nether Poppleton (11/03253/FULM)	To enable Members to view the site.	Cllrs Boyce, Cunningham-Cross, D'Agorne, Funnell, Galvin, McIlveen, Merrett, Reid, Watson and Watt.

36. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Members were asked to declare at this point in the meeting any personal or prejudicial interests they might have in the business on the agenda.

Councillor Williams declared a personal and prejudicial interest in item 4b (The Abattoir, Murton Lane, Murton) as he is employed by Yorkshire Water and Yorkshire Water were consulted on the application. He advised Members he would abstain from the vote regarding condition 5 (Surface Water Drainage).

Councillor McIlveen declared a personal non prejudicial interest in agenda item 5 (Public Consultation on Draft Supplementary Planning Guidance) as a member of York Residential Landlords Association.

37. MINUTES

RESOLVED: That the minutes of the last meeting of the Committee held on 19 January 2012 be approved and signed by the Chair as a correct record.

38. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

It was reported that there had been no registrations to speak at the meeting under the Council's Public Participation Scheme.

39. PLANS LIST

Members considered the report of the Assistant Director (Planning and Sustainable Development) relating to the following planning applications, which outlined the proposals and relevant planning considerations and set out the views of the consultees and officers.

39a Plot 8B, Great North Way, Nether Poppleton, York (11/03253/FULM)

The Committee considered a full major application (13 weeks) submitted by Dobbies Garden Centre Ltd for the erection of a garden centre retail development incorporating a restaurant/cafe and farm food hall with associated access, landscaping, car park, outdoor display areas and a hand car wash.

Officers stated that a revised landscaping plan had been submitted in response to the Landscape Architect's comments and the landscape architect had noted that there would be some loss of existing trees on site but these would be compensated by new tree planting. However the scheme would benefit from an increased population of larger species trees such as Oak and Ash. He stated that the aesthetics of the scheme remain unsatisfactory on Opus Avenue, although to a degree this was out of the applicants control, it would be beneficial to achieve greater planting within this location.

Officers also reported that the Environmental Protection Unit had requested a condition to prevent noise issues during the operation of the proposed development and asked for further information regarding the air quality impact by virtue of the nearby dwellings. They had agreed with the applicant that the provision of electric vehicle recharge points could be dealt with through the green travel plan.

Officers advised of the following amendments to the proposed conditions

- Condition 1 – replacement drawing number
- Condition 3 – Figure for on-site renewable energy sources should read 10% not 5%
- Condition 11 – re landscaping scheme - insert drawing number SB/YK/P/01 Revision C received 30 January 2012
- Condition 18 should read “the cafe/restaurant, *including the kitchens*, shall not exceed in floor area 1010 sqm specified on drawing number 1858(PL)308.
- Condition 19 – remove second part of condition (referring to specialist foodstuffs) as it is not considered reasonable in accordance with the tests set out in Circular 11/95
- Condition 20 – reworded to include conditions 17 and 26. Some goods have been restricted as they are considered ancillary rather than primary goods of a garden centre. Internal floor area differs slightly to that specified in report as floor area of potential eco-department was not included.
- Conditions 17 and 26 removed as they are now included in condition 20.

Officers advised that standard condition VISQ8 (external materials) and a condition for fencing should also be added.

It was noted that following the site visit and chair’s briefing, the following alterations were requested: a dedicated taxi bay; moving the cycle shelters close to the front entrance; and widening of the pedestrian footway to accommodate both pedestrian and cycle traffic. Members were advised that the applicant had declined to alter their proposals.

[A full copy of the officers’ update has been published online with the agenda on the Council’s website.]

Representations were received from the agent of a local garden centre in objection to the application. He agreed that the revised conditions were helpful but didn't go all the way to meeting his concerns which included the use of the 20 minutes drive time for the retail assessment, and the number of jobs which would be lost would not overcome those created by the proposal.

Representations were also heard from the agent in support of the application. He stated that this application was the culmination of several years hard work to find a suitable site in York for Dobbies and they had been encouraged by the positive feedback from public and key stakeholders at the consultation event. He confirmed that the site provided a suitable opportunity for the Dobbies to achieve its high quality aspirations in York and it would also provide new job opportunities.

Members raised concerns that there was no lighting times proposed and asked that a condition be added to control these. Officers suggested that condition 14 (method and design of external lighting) could be expanded to include times.

Members expressed their overall support for the scheme but raised and discussed the following concerns:

- Public Transport Links – Members noted that the nearest bus stop was some 300m away from the site, that the no 10 bus service was not frequent on Sundays and the no 20 bus service took a slow and winding route. They also pointed out that not all staff would have their own transport and that cycle provision parking was still not right and would benefit from space for bike trailers which were being used by more and more people. Members asked for consideration to be given to the applicant being asked to provide a taxi pick up/drop off point outside the entrance.

The applicant's agent raised concerns that siting a taxi rank outside the main entrance would detract from the appearance of the entrance area and could potentially pose a danger to pedestrians.

- Food Hall – Members raised concerns about the proposed size of the food hall (condition allows max 450msq) and the types of products which would be

sold. They questioned whether this could create competition with other food shops in Poppleton. One Member proposed that this be reduced to 300msq to reduce the likelihood of competition with local mainstream shops.

The applicant's agent confirmed that the food hall would operate as an ancillary part of the garden centre rather than a stand alone convenience retail operation and that their intention was not to compete with local shops.

- High Percentage of ancillary goods – One Member stated that the 15% limit for ancillary goods was too large considering the size of the overall site and proposed that this be reduced to 10%.
- Loss of employment land – Members raised concerns that this site has been designated as employment land not retail and there was not sufficient evidence regarding creation of new jobs.
- Capacity of ring road – Concern was expressed that this development would lead to more congestion and pollution on the ring road.
- Development is unsustainable – One Member stated that none of the produce to be sold will be grown on site.

Members acknowledged that it was important to be able to agree on a suitable location for Dobbies to set up in York and acknowledged that siting a venture such as this and ensuring that it is accessible to everyone would always be a challenge. With regard to the concerns raised, Members acknowledged that it would be possible for taxi's to drop off/pick up outside the entrance without the need for a specific taxi rank. Members were advised that the range of goods proposed to be sold was the norm in garden centres throughout the country and with regard to the proposal to reduce the amount of ancillary goods to 10% would lead to a lack of consistency across the city and pointed out that Poppleton Garden Centre had a 15% limit. Members agreed that development of the site would be an improvement for what is currently an empty and desolate site.

Councillors D'Agorne and Watson asked that it be recorded that they voted against the application.

RESOLVED: That the application be approved subject to the conditions listed in the report, the amended and additional conditions below, the removal of conditions 17 and 26 (incorporated into amended condition 20) plus the amendment of condition 14 on lighting to include specific times (details to be delegated to officers in conjunction with Chair and Vice-Chair of the Committee)

Amended Condition 1

The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following plans:-

Drawing Number 1858(PL)303 Revision C received 26 January 2012

Drawing Number 1858(PL)304 received 7 December 2011

Drawing Number 1858(PL)305 received 7 December 2011

Drawing Number 1858(PL)306 Revision B received 27 January 2012

Drawing Number 1858(PL)307 Revision A received 7 December 2011

Drawing Number 1858 (PL)308 received 7 December 2011

Drawing Number 1858(PL)309 Revision A received 27 January 2012

Drawing Number 1858(PL)310 received 7 December 2011

Drawing Number 1858(PL)311 Revision A received 7 December 2011

Drawing Number 1858(PL)312 received 7 December 2011

Drawing Number 1858(PL)313 received 7 December 2011

Document 5: Floodrisk Assessment and Drainage Statement submitted 7 December 2011

Document 8: Ecological Survey Report submitted 7 December 2011

Drawing Number SB/YK/P/01 Revision C received 30 January 2012

Drawing Number E14 received 6 December 2011;

Reason: For the avoidance of doubt and to ensure that the development is carried out only as approved by the Local Planning Authority.

Amended Condition 3

No building work shall take place until details have been submitted and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority, to demonstrate how the development will provide from on-site renewable energy sources, *10 per cent* of the development's predicted energy requirements. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the submitted details unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The approved scheme shall be implemented before first occupation of the development. The site thereafter must be maintained to the required level of generation.

Reason: To ensure that the proposal complies with the principles of sustainable development and the Council's adopted Interim Planning Statement on Sustainable Design and Construction

Amended Condition 11

The landscaping scheme shall be in accordance with *Drawing Number SB/YK/P/01 Revision C received 30 January 2012*. Prior to development a specification for ground preparation for all planting and seeding, and tree pit details shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. This scheme shall be implemented within a period of six months of the completion of the development. Any trees or plants which within a period of five years from the completion of the development, die, are removed or become seriously damaged or diseased, shall be replaced in the next planting season with others of a similar size and species, unless the Local Planning Authority agrees alternatives in writing.

Reason: So that the Local Planning Authority may be satisfied with the variety, suitability and disposition of species within the entire site, since the landscape scheme is integral to the amenity of the development.

Amended Condition 18

The cafe/restaurant, *including the kitchens*, shall not exceed in floor area (*1010 sqm*) specified on drawing number 1858(PL)308.

Reason: To define the nature of the approval hereby granted, to control the nature and extent of retail activities to ensure the protection of the vitality and viability of York city and district

centres and in accordance with the objectives of PPS4
"Planning for Sustainable Economic Growth".

Amended Condition 19

The food hall hereby permitted shall not exceed in floor area (450 sqm) specified on drawing number 1858(PL) 308.

Reason: To define the nature of the approval hereby granted, to control the nature and extent of retail activities to ensure the protection of the vitality and viability of York city and district centres and in accordance with the objectives of PPS4
"Planning for Sustainable Economic Growth".

Amended Condition 20

The premises shall be used as a garden centre (incorporating a cafe/restaurant and foodhall) and for no other purposes including any other purpose in Class A1 of the Schedule to the Town and Country Planning (Use Classes) Order 1987, or in any provision equivalent to that Class in any Statutory Instrument revoking and re-enacting that Order.

Sales from the garden centre shall be limited to the following goods, products and services:

- (a) goods and services related to gardens and gardening,
- (b) horticultural products, trees, plants, shrubs, house plants and flowers of any type including fresh and dried flowers,
- (c) garden and gardening equipment, tools and accessories,
- (d) machinery for garden use and servicing of it,
- (e) barbeques and their accessories,
- (f) conservatories,
- (g) outdoor and conservatory furniture, furnishings and accessories,
- (h) sheds, garden buildings, greenhouses, summerhouses, gazeboes, pergolas, garden offices,
- (i) ponds and materials and fittings for their servicing,

- (j) fencing, trellis and landscaping materials,
- (k) aquatics, water garden equipment, and their accessories, water recycling products,
- (l) garden ornaments and statuary, baskets and other containers for the growing and display of indoor and outdoor plants and flowers,
- (m) pets, pet accessories, pet care and advice,
- (n) Christmas trees (live and artificial) and decorations
- (o) ancillary restaurant/coffee shop
- (p) live poultry and bird care products
- (q) wood /biomass burning products and wood burning stoves
- (r) ancillary food hall

The following range of goods shall be limited to 15% (1076 sqm) of the total internal floorspace (7178 sqm) including the cold house and polytunnels:

- (i) books, magazines, periodicals, videos and CD and DVDs; all relating to gardening,
- (ii) hobbies, camping equipment, toys, games, crafts and garden play equipment,
- (iii) baskets, wickerwork and country crafts,
- (iv) china, glass, vases and pots,
- (v) outdoor clothing and footwear, including wellington boots, garden aprons and smocks, gardening boots and clogs, gardening gloves, gardening hats, gardening rainproofs and gardening overalls,
- (vi) Gift lines and greetings cards
- (vii) eco living, solar and environmental products

(viii) unspecified garden retail goods

Reason: To define the nature of the approval hereby granted, to control the nature and extent of retail activities conducted from the site and to ensure the protection of the vitality and viability of the surrounding urban centres in accordance with the objectives of PPS4 "Planning for Sustainable Economic Growth".

Additional Condition

Notwithstanding any proposed materials specified on the approved drawings or in the application form submitted with the application, samples of the external materials to be used shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to the commencement of the development. The development shall be carried out using the approved materials.

Reason: So as to achieve a visually cohesive appearance.

Additional Condition

Details of all means of enclosure to the site boundaries (including colour and finish) shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority before the development commences and shall be provided before the development is occupied.

Reason: In the interests of the visual amenities of the area.

Additional Condition

The external car park lighting shall be switched off a maximum of 30 minutes after the store has closed for business, and switched on a maximum of 30 minutes before the store opens for business.

Reason: In order to protect the amenities of the neighbours and the character and appearance of the area from excessive illumination.

[Note: This was added as a separate condition rather than an amendment to condition 14]

REASON: The proposal, subject to the conditions listed in the report, the amended and additional conditions above, the removal of conditions 17 and 26 and the amendment of condition 14 (lighting), would not cause undue harm to interests of acknowledged importance, with

particular reference to retail impact, safeguarding of employment land, residential amenity, visual amenity, highway impact, contamination, air quality, Flood risk, nature conservation. As such the proposal complies with Policies P7A, SP8, GP1, GP3, GP4A, GP4B, GP9, GP11, GP15A, NE5, NE5B, NE6, T2, T7C, T13A, T20, E3A, E3B, S2, S12 of the City of York Development Control Local Plan.

**39b The Abattoir, Murton Lane, Murton, York YO19 5UF
(11/03259/FULM)**

The Committee considered a full application submitted by Mr Tom Kirwan for the development of a new abattoir and food production facility with associated landscaping and access following the demolition of the existing abbatoir.

Officers provided the Committee with an update on the following issues

- Highways Issues - Officers advised the Committee that comments had now been received from the council's highways officers who have no objection to the proposals subject to some additional conditions being attached and in particular, submission of a method of works statement and details of visibility splays, both of which have been agreed by the applicant. The Cabinet Member had asked that the number of cycle parking spaces be increased to match the current usage (30% of staff currently cycle to work) which would require 57 spaces. Highways officers have advised that to take into account shift working, 40 spaces should be provided initially (increased from 25 proposed) which has been agreed by the applicant.
- Habitat Mitigation - Officers advised that, with regard to the applicant's proposals for mitigating the loss of trees, hedges and other habitats, the Cabinet Member has asked that further mitigation be provided. Officers have extensively investigated the possibilities for providing additional mitigation on site, immediately adjacent to the site or elsewhere but there is no opportunity for this within the site.

- Landscaping - With regard to landscaping details, which are required as a condition of approval, officers advised that for the avoidance of doubt an informative should be added to Condition 8 (Landscaping) making clear that the council expects the landscaping scheme to include large-species, semi-mature trees and wildflowers. Officers advised that the Cabinet Members had also asked that Condition 8 be strengthened to require the proposed screening along the south-west boundary to be provided permanently. The condition as drafted implies that the agreed landscaping scheme would be retained permanently and requires that any trees that die or are removed during the first five years following completion are replaced, but that requiring the landscaping scheme to be retained in perpetuity is likely to be an unreasonable requirement.
- Operating Hours - Officers have agreed with the applicant the operating hours of the new plant (the hours of the existing plant are uncontrolled) and the agreed hours will be made a new condition of approval.
- Sustainability - The applicant has accepted the council's suggested condition that 10% of energy should be produced on site from renewable sources.

[A full copy of the officers' update has been published online with the agenda on the Council's website.]

Therefore officers confirmed the following additional conditions would be required.

- HWAY 10 Details of vehicular areas to be approved
- HWAY 14 Access details to be approved
- HWAY 31 No mud on highway during construction
- HWAY 40 Dilapidation survey to be carried out.
- Details of proposed visibility splays to be submitted and agreed
- Method of Works statement to be submitted and agreed
- Operating Hours to be specified as 0600-2400 Mon to Fri and 0600-1700 Sat.

They advised that the following conditions be revised

- Add informative to Condition 4 (Landscaping)
- Condition 6 (Car and Cycle parking) – specify min. 40 cycle spaces.
- Condition 7 (Travel Plan)
- Condition 8 (Sustainability)

They also advised that the plan was incorrect in the agenda papers.

Representations were heard from Councillor Warters, Ward Member for Osbaldwick, on behalf of Murton Parish Council. He raised concerns regarding intrusion into the greenbelt and loss of mature trees on the site. However he commended the approach taken by ABP during the application process stating they had met with Murton Parish Council and alleviated many concerns raised by the local community and acknowledged that the expansion was likely to benefit both the livestock centre and local community. He stressed that the 10% renewable energy figure should be considered an absolute minimum. He asked that appropriate levels of restrained signage is used at the entrance to the site and that reactive lighting is considered. He requested that both Murton Parish Council and he are consulted with regard to lighting schemes (condition 16), the travel plan (condition 7) .and financial support in respect of mitigation for loss of habitat (condition 9).

Members discussed the following issues:

Loss of Trees - Members requested that the applicant liaised further with the adjacent land owner with regard to providing off site mitigation in respect of the loss of trees, hedges and other habitats. They also suggested that if the parking was rearranged slightly with a loss of only 8-9 spaces, this could save three of the Willow trees along the southern boundary of the site.

The applicants advised Members that they had investigated options for retaining more of the trees on the site and the proposal in front of Members was the outcome of this. In terms of mitigation, they stated that for each tree removed, three new trees would be planted on the site. They advised that if the Willow trees in question were to be retained it would mean the loss of more than 8-9 car parking spaces as it was important to consider not just the area of the base of the tree but also how far the roots and crown of trees extend into the circulation

areas. Officers disagreed that more spaces would have to be lost. The applicants agreed to amend the parking layout to protect the three specified Willows along the southern boundary.

10% Renewable Energy Target – The applicants explained how they aimed to operate well above the required 10% target. Members suggested that other sustainable features such as solar panel and rainwater collection could be considered.

Operating hours - The applicants confirmed that at present no specific operating hours were set for the plant which was demand driven. They advised that the abattoir can start very early and may be finished by lunchtime or may operate into early evening and that livestock deliveries were currently late at night and early morning. Members acknowledged that the proposed conditions would ensure that deliveries and operating hours were more restricted than at present.

Members agreed that this was an important investment for the city and expressed their support for the application. However they stressed the need to ensure that effective screening around the SW of the site to minimise views from the A64 and asked for tighter controls requiring the maintenance of tree belts. Officers agreed that condition 4 could be strengthened so it refers to retaining the landscape belt into the future.

At the request of Councillor Williams, and in view of his declaration of interest as an employee of Yorkshire Water, the Committee took a separate vote on condition 5 (surface water drainage) and Councillor Williams abstained from the vote. He participated in the vote for the overall application.

RESOLVED: That the application be approved subject to the conditions listed in the report and the amended and additional conditions below:

New Condition

HWAY 10 Details of vehicular areas to be approved

New Condition

HWAY 14 Access details to be approved

New Condition

HWAY 31 No mud on highway during construction

New Condition

HWAY 40 Dilapidation survey to be carried out.

New Condition (Visibility Splays)

Prior to the commencement of any works details of proposed visibility splays shall be submitted to and agreed in writing by the local planning authority. The approved works shall be implemented prior to operation of the development.

Reason: In the interests of highway safety.

New Condition (Method of Works)

Prior to the commencement of any works, a detailed method of works statement shall be submitted to and agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority. This statement shall include the precautions to be taken to ensure the safety of the general public, the method of securing the site, access to the site and the route to be taken by vehicles transporting the demolition and construction material, and the hours during which this will be permitted.

Reason: to ensure that the works are carried out in a safe manner and with minimum disruption to users of the adjacent public highway.

New Condition (Operating Hours)

No machinery shall be operated, no process shall be carried out and no deliveries taken or despatched from the site outside the following times: 0600-2400 hours Mondays to Fridays and 0600-2400 hours on Saturdays. Nor at any time on Sundays, Bank or Public Holidays.

Reason: To protect the amenity of local residents and businesses

Amended Condition 4

No development shall take place until there has been submitted and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority a detailed landscape scheme which shall include the species, stock size, planting details and position of trees, shrubs and other plants as compensatory planting for the loss of trees. This scheme shall be implemented within a period of six months of the completion of the development. Any trees or plants which die, are removed or become seriously damaged or diseased, shall be replaced in the next planting season with others of a similar size and species, unless the Local Planning Authority agrees alternatives in writing. This also applies to any existing

trees that are shown to be retained within the approved landscape scheme.

Reason: So that the Local Planning Authority may be satisfied with the variety, suitability and disposition of species as compensation for loss of trees.

Add Informative to Condition 4 (Landscaping)

The submitted landscape scheme should include, as mitigation, a high percentage of large-species trees and advanced nursery stock, including semi-mature trees. Similarly the scheme should show how the proposed hedgerow would be supplemented by a suitable wildflower mix in order to provide some mitigation for the loss of floral interest along the existing ditch along the south-west side of the site.

Amended condition 6 (car and cycle parking)

Prior to the development commencing full details of car parking, delivery/service vehicle parking, cycle storage for at least 40 cycles (including means of enclosure), vehicle turning areas and the means of access into the site shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority and thereafter such areas shall be retained solely for their intended purpose.

Reason: In the interests of highway safety and to promote the use of cycles.

Amended condition 7 (Travel Plan)

Within six months of occupation of the site, the applicant shall submit and agree in writing with the LPA an updated Green Travel Plan for employees and visitors, setting out measures to promote sustainable travel and reduce dependency on the private car, in accordance with the current advice issued by the Department of Transport.

Reason: to promote sustainable modes of transport and reduce car travel, in accordance with the Authority's transport policies.

Amended Condition 8 (Sustainability)

In accordance with the Council's Interim Planning Statement on Sustainable Design and Construction, the applicant will incorporate on-site renewable energy/low carbon energy generation equipment to provide at least 10 per cent of the development's regulated energy demand. In addition, the applicant will achieve a sustainability measurement standard comparable to at least BREEAM standard 'very good'. Details

will be submitted to the council and approved in writing prior to the commencement of development.

Reason: To ensure that the proposal complies with the principles of sustainable development and the Council's adopted Interim Planning Statement on Sustainable Design and Construction.

REASON FOR APPROVAL:

The proposal, subject to the conditions listed in the report and the amended and additional conditions above, would not cause undue harm to interests of acknowledged importance, with particular reference to the Economic Impact, impact on the Green Belt, design and appearance, neighbour amenity, landscape, bio-diversity, drainage, environmental protection, highway matters and sustainability. As such the proposal complies with policies E4, GP1, GP4a, GP6, GP9, GP15a, GB1, GB11, T4, NE1, NE2, NE6 and NE7 of the City of York Local Plan Deposit Draft.

40. PUBLIC CONSULTATION ON DRAFT SUPPLEMENTARY PLANNING DOCUMENTS

The Committee considered a report which informed them that the Council was currently out to public consultation on the following draft Supplementary Planning Documents (SPDs):

- Controlling the Concentration of Houses in Multiple Occupation
- Subdivision of Dwellings
- House Extensions and Alterations

Officers clarified that this item had been included on the agenda to raise awareness amongst Members about the ongoing consultation process and to give them the opportunity to view the three draft documents. They responded to issues raised with regard to the documents and requested comments to be made through the consultation process.

RESOLVED:

- (i) That it be noted that the three SPDs are currently out to public consultation between 23 January and 5 March 2012.

- (ii) That, if Members of the Committee wish to make comments on the draft documents, these should be made directly to officers.

REASON:

To give Members of the Planning Committee the opportunity to comment on the SPDs if required.

Cllr Cunningham-Cross, Chair

[The meeting started at 4.30 pm and finished at 6.20 pm].